### Isotopes and Animal Movement Utah 23 June 2015 Keith A. Hobson



### Outline

- Linking animals to isoscapes: animals add variance!
  - Transfer functions and turnover ...
  - Physiology/nutrition/ecology ...
  - Reflections on  $\delta^2 H$  measurements ...
- Applications:
- Where to from here?

### The basic principles of trophic level and source determinations

Respiration (<sup>12</sup>C)

Primary Production

Herbivore



Excretion (<sup>14</sup>N)



#### δ<sup>2</sup>H of Annual Precipitation

\*\*\*\*









Need for a transfer function will depend on isotope ...

- No need if there is no discrimination
  e.g. heavy elements
  Important if there is discrimination
  e.g. lighter elements
  Metabolism and other rate-limiting steps
  - Ecology/physiology

# Pb isotopes linked to surficial geology ...





Stewart et al. MMS 19:806-818

### Hg isotopes





Point et al. 2011 Nature Geoscience

### Strontium (bedrock model)



C.P. Bataille, G.J. Bowen / Chemical Geology 304-305 (2012) 39-52



Work of Barnet-Johnson in Hobson, Barnet-Johnson and Cerling (isoscapes book, 2010)

### For the light isotopes ...

- 1. Create a simple basemap through broad spatial sampling of animal tissue.
- 2. Infer a calibration *relationship* through limited spatial sampling across an isotopic gradient.
- 3. Experimentally derive the calibration relationship through controlled (captive) studies.

## An early application using $\delta^2$ H to track Monarch migration ....



#### Are monarchs declining due to factors on breeding grounds? Wintering grounds? Both?



Year (data collected during December)

## Two populations, one long distance journey ....



### Previously, tagging was used:



### Monarchs can be "grown" anywhere!









## 80 elementary schools recruited throughout the range .....









### The basemap for the year of interest:





## Origins: 50% of the population is produced in the US comblelt:



#### Docykx et al. Ecol. Applic., in press

### Transfer function ....





Hobson et al. 1999 Oecologia 120:397-404

## Transfer function derived experimentally ....





Hobson et al. 1999 Oecologia 120:397-404



### Nebraska "deer isoscape"





#### Henaux et al. MEE 2011



# Transfer function through limted sampling (gradients)









Hobson et al. 2012 PLoS ONE

### Single Top Model:

•  $\delta^2 H_f = Int. + \delta^2 H_p + Migratory Guild + Foraging Substrate + Guild*Substrate$ 

• Explains ~83% of the variance in  $\delta^2 H_f$ 

### Mechanisms?

Foraging substrate:
Microhabitat/dietary variation in δ<sup>2</sup>H?
Migratory guild:
Molt phenology, feather growth rate?

### Dragonfly wing isoscape









Hobson et al. 2012 MEE 3:766-772

| Species                              | Equation            | $r^2$ | Model | Source                      |
|--------------------------------------|---------------------|-------|-------|-----------------------------|
| Birds:                               | 22 5 92 <b></b>     |       |       |                             |
| 6 species of North American songbird | δD=-31 + 0.9δDp     | 0.83  | Н     | Hobson and Wassenaar (1997) |
| 6 species of North American songbird | δD=-25 + 0.9δDp     | 0.88  | В     | Clark et al. (2006)         |
| 6 species of North American songbird | δD=-19.4 + 1.07δDp  | 0.86  | В     | Bowen et al. (2005)         |
| Black-throated Blue Warbler          | δD=-51 + 0.5δDp     | 0.86  | CH    | Chamberlain et al. (1997)   |
| Red-winged blackbird                 | δD=-27 + 1.1δDp     | 0.83  | Н     | Wassenaar and Hobson (2000) |
| Bicknell's Thrush                    | δD=-26 + 0.7δDp     | 0.48  | Н     | Hobson et al (2001)         |
| Wilson's Warbler                     | δD=-51.7 + 0.4δDp   | 0.36  | В     | J. Kelly (unpublished)      |
| Wilson's Warbler                     | δD=+14.47 + 1.41δDp | 0.91  | Μ     | Paxton et al. (2007)        |
| Wilson's Warbler                     | δD=-21 + 0.7δDp     | 0.48  | Μ     | Meehan et al. (2004)        |
| Mountain Plover                      | δD=+17.4 + 1.26δDp  | 0.36  | В     | Wunder (2007)               |
| 23 species of European birds         | δD=-7.8 + 1.27δDp   | 0.65  | В     | Hobson et al. (2004d)       |
| 23 species of European birds         | δD=-22.3+0.77δDp    | 0.85  | В     | Bowen et al. (2005)         |
| Cooper's Hawk                        | δD=-34 + 1.0δDp     | 0.83  | H     | Meehan et al. (2001)        |
| Inland generalist raptors            | δD=-40+0.62δDp      | 0.59  | H     | Lott et al. (2003)          |
| Inland bird-eating raptor            | δD=-44.2+0.54δDp    | 0.37  | Н     | Lott et al. (2003)          |
| Coastal generalist raptors           | δD=-38.8+0.55δDp    | 0.19  | Н     | Lott et al. (2003)          |
| Coastal bird-eating raptors          | δD=-104.7-0.59δDp   | 0.12  | Н     | Lott et al. (2003)          |
| Non-coastal bird-eating raptors      | δD=-41.1+0.58δDp    | 0.46  | Н     | Lott et al. (2003)          |
| 9 species of raptors                 | δD=-52.2+0.28δDp    | 0.09  | Н     | Lott et al. (2003)          |
| 9 species of diurnal raptors         | δD=-37 + 0.6δDp     | 0.51  | Μ     | Meehan et al. (2004)        |
| Raptors in South Carolina            | δD=-25 + 0.7δDp     | 0.18  | Μ     | Meehan et al. (2004)        |
| Flammulated Owl                      | δD=-8 + 0.9δDp      | 0.66  | Μ     | Meehan et al. (2004)        |
| 12 species of raptors                | δD=-5.6 + 0.91δDp   | 0.62  | Μ     | Lott and Smith (2006)       |
| Scaup                                | δD=-27.8 + 0.95Dp   | 0.64  | В     | Clark et al. (2006)         |
| Mallards and Northern Pintail        | δD=-57 + 0.835Dp    | 0.56  | Μ     | Hebert and Wassenaar (2005) |
| Other animals:                       |                     |       |       |                             |
| Deer collagen                        | δD= 4 + 1.02δDp     | 0.94  | С     | Cormie et al. (1994)        |
| Hoary bat                            | δD=-25 + 0.8δDp     | 0.60  | Μ     | Cryan et al. (2004)         |
| Monarch butterfly                    | δD=-79 + 0.62δDp    | 0.69  | Н     | Hobson et al. (1999)        |
| Beetle (chitin)                      | δD=33.2 + 1.60δDp   | 0.74  | В     | Gröcke et al. (2006)        |











dot-opp\_resistance twents
Residuals IDW

Production Map

[sth-sop\_resistance] (restances (restances)

- 56.9205664 - 16.0737645

- 66.9730666 - 26.0377645

- 6.9730666 - 26.0377612

- 2.92357412 - 1.09201905

I stances - 2.3733443

0 stances - 2.3733443

1 stances - 2.373344

1 stances - 2.373344

1 stances - 2.37344

1 stances - 2.37344

1 stances - 2.3734

1 stances - 2.3734

1 stances - 2.373

1 stances - 2.37

1 stances - 2.37

1 stances - 2.373

1 stances - 2.37

1 stances - 2.373







### Several controlled studies for $\delta^{15}N$ , $\delta^{13}C$ but few for $\delta^{2}H$ , $\delta^{18}O$ ....

### • $\delta^{15}N, \delta^{13}C \dots$



























### Multiple sources of O and H



Pietsch et al. 2011 PLoS ONE



#### Pietsch et al. 2011 PLoS ONE


Pietsch et al. 2011 PLoS ONE



Pietsch et al. 2011 PLoS ONE



Pietsch et al. 2011 PLoS ONE

Stable-hydrogen isotope heterogeneity in keratinous materials: mass spectrometry and migratory wildlife tissue subsampling strategies

Leonard I. Wassenaar\* and Keith A. Hobson



| Species            | Individual #<br>(mg) | Feather<br>δD mean<br>(SD), ‰ | n  | Feather<br>range, ‰ | Feather<br>CV | Rachis mean<br>(SD), ‰ | n | Rachis<br>range, ‰ | Rachis<br>CV | ∆ Feather-rachis<br>‰ |
|--------------------|----------------------|-------------------------------|----|---------------------|---------------|------------------------|---|--------------------|--------------|-----------------------|
| Captive Raised     |                      |                               |    |                     |               |                        |   |                    |              |                       |
| Poultry            | 1 (0.25)             | -145 (2.5)                    | 12 | -148 to -139        | 1.7           |                        |   |                    |              |                       |
|                    | 1 (0.35)             | -147 (2.4)                    | 12 | -151 to -143        | 1.6           | -146 (5.3)             | 5 | -152 to -138       | 3.6          | 1.0                   |
|                    | 1 (0.45)             | -150(2.5)                     | 12 | -154 to -146        | 1.7           |                        |   |                    |              |                       |
|                    | 2 (0.35)             | -146 (4.5)                    | 10 | -137 to -150        | 3.1           | -147 (5.5)             | 5 | -155 to -141       | 3.7          | 1.0                   |
|                    | 2 (1.0)              | -144(2.5)                     | 10 | -150 to -140        | 1.7           |                        |   |                    |              |                       |
|                    | 2 (2.0) <sup>a</sup> | -155 (10.9)                   | 10 | -170 to -133        | 7.0           |                        |   |                    |              |                       |
|                    | 3 (0.25)             | -169 (1.6)                    | 11 | -171 to -166        | 1.0           |                        |   |                    |              |                       |
|                    | 3 (0.35)             | -171 (1.6)                    | 12 | -174 to -169        | 1.0           | -177(2.8)              | 5 | -180 to -173       | 1.6          | 6.0                   |
|                    | 3 (0.45)             | -175 (1.3)                    | 11 | -178 to -173        | 0.7           |                        |   |                    |              |                       |
|                    | 3 (0.60)             | -175(1.0)                     | 12 | -177 to -174        | 0.5           |                        |   |                    |              |                       |
| Wild Birds         |                      |                               |    |                     |               |                        |   |                    |              |                       |
| Swainson's thrush  | 1                    | -64 (2)                       | 3  | -66 to -63          | 3.1           | -74 (8)                | 3 | -80 to -71         | 10.8         | 10.0                  |
|                    | 2                    | -81 (3)                       | 3  | -84 to -78          | 3.7           | -90 (10)               | 3 | -97 to -78         | 11.1         | 9.0                   |
|                    | 3                    | -67 (1)                       | 3  | -68 to -66          | 1.5           | -75 (5)                | 3 | -80 to -71         | 6.7          | 8.0                   |
|                    | 4                    | -88 (4)                       | 3  | -91 to -83          | 4.8           | -96 (2)                | 3 | -99 to -94         | 2.1          | 8.0                   |
|                    | 5                    | -81 (9)                       | 3  | -90 to -73          | 1.1           | -85 (5)                | 3 | -90 to -80         | 5.9          | 4.0                   |
|                    | 6                    | -66 (2)                       | 3  | -69 to -64          | 3.0           | -75 (6)                | 3 | -81 to -69         | 8.0          | 9.0                   |
|                    | 7                    | -72 (2)                       | 3  | -74 to -71          | 2.8           | -76 (5)                | 3 | -82 to -72         | 6.6          | 4.0                   |
|                    | 8                    | -90 (1)                       | 3  | -92 to -89          | 1.1           | -96 (5)                | 3 | -100 to -90        | 5.2          | 6.0                   |
|                    | 9                    | -85 (2)                       | 3  | -86 to -82          | 2.4           | -88 (6)                | 3 | -94 to -83         | 6.8          | 3.0                   |
| Lesser scaup       | 1                    | -122 (2)                      | 6  | -124 to -118        | 1.6           | -128                   | 2 | -128 to -128       | _            | 6.0                   |
| Roseatte spoonbill | 1                    | -23 (6)                       | 6  | -32 to -13          | 26.1          | -28 (7)                | 3 | -35 to -21         | 25           | 5.0                   |
| Andean condor      | 1                    | -106 (4.6)                    | 20 | -112 to -98         | 4.3           | -110 (6)               | 5 | -119 to -108       | 5.5          | 4.0                   |
| Bald eagle         | 1                    | -103(13)                      | 19 | -120 to -79         | 126           | 106 (11)               | 5 | -120 to -93        | 10.4         | 3.0                   |

\*2 mg sample and reference keratins dynamically diluted by 50% with He.





Studds et al. (2012) Diversity and Distributions 1-12.

The Condor 113(3):555-564 © The Cooper Ornithological Society 2011

CORRELATES OF DEUTERIUM (&D) ENRICHMENT IN THE FEATHERS OF ADULT AMERICAN KESTRELS OF KNOWN ORIGIN

JENNIFER L. GREENWOOD<sup>1</sup> AND RUSSELL D. DAWSON

Juveniles show strong  $\delta^2 H_f vs. \delta^2 H_p$  BUT not adults ...

See also

Also seen in some owls



<sup>1</sup>H<sub>2</sub>O loss through gular fluttering Caeca involved in H<sub>2</sub>O regulation



# Using a wind tunnel and isotopic dietary shifts to mimic migration





#### Max Planck Institute for Ornithology

## Oxygen?







#### Human Hair





#### Ehleringer et al. (PNAS 2008)

#### Stable Isotope Analysis of Modern Human Hair Collected From Asia (China, India, Mongolia, and Pakistan)

A.H. Thompson,<sup>1,2</sup>\* L.A. Chesson,<sup>1,2</sup> D.W. Podlesak,<sup>1,2</sup> G.J. Bowen,<sup>3</sup> T.E. Cerling,<sup>1,2,4</sup> and J.R. Ehleringer<sup>1,2</sup> AMERICAN JOURNAL OF PHYSICAL ANTHROPOLOGY 000:000-000 (2010)



### Meteoric relationship preserved in Monarch Butterflies











Hydrogen isotopes work better than Oxygen isotopes .....









#### Tissue turnover

- Over what period do tissue isotope values represent dietary integration?
  - Single compartment "exponential" models
  - Multiple compartment "reaction progress" models



## The isotopic clock and movement

Biome 2



8X (per mil)

## Hydrogen



Involves a doubling of mass, so isotopic effects are large

## Hydrogen exchange:



#### Things to know about H:

- <sup>2</sup>H/<sup>1</sup>H represents high potential for isotopic discrimination.
- O-H and N-H bonds are weak: exchange.
- Drinking water and diet are sources of H.
- Recent analytical advances (CFIRMS) have lead to small sample requirements:
  - Sample inhomogeneities are now important.
  - Laboratory standards are esp. important.







#### TRACKING ANIMAL MIGRATION WITH STABLE ISOTOPES

edited by Keith A. Hobson & Leonard I. Wassenaar

VOLUME 2 IN THE TERRESTILIAL ECOLOGY SERIES

## Primary Goals of Migration Research

Evolution and Ecology.
Conservation and Management.
Movement of Contaminants and Disease.







# Biogeochemical processes result in isotopic patterns or "isoscapes" ...









#### Isoscapes?

•Terrestrial-marine ( $\delta^{13}C, \delta^{15}N \delta^{34}S$ ) Inshore-offshore ( $\delta^{13}C$ ,  $\delta^{34}S$ ,  $\delta^{15}N$ ) •C-3 vs. C-4, CAM ( $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta$ D) •Xeric vs. Mesic ( $\delta^{13}C, \delta^{15}N$ ) •Latitudinal/altitudinal gradients ( $\delta D$ ,  $\delta^{13}C$ ) Surficial geology (Sr, Pb, others)

### First isotope applications



Killingley (1980) –  $\delta^{18}$ O barnacles "you are what you swim through"

Killingley and Lutcavage (1983)  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O





From Schell et al.2002

### **Bowhead whales**

















Temperature and  $CO_2$  controls planktonic  $\delta^{13}C$  across latitudes









Quillfeldt et al. (2010) BES.



# Latest marine isoscapes ....

McMahon et al (2013) Limnol. Oceanogr. 58:697-714

















#### Problems with extrinsic markers

- Organism often needs to be recovered
- Expensive
- Body size requirements
- Biased to original marked population




Mesic to xeric isotopic gradients help "locate" individuals and their tissues ...





#### Forensic tracing of African ivory ....



 $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{15}$ N,  $\delta^{87}$ Sr,  $\delta^{204}$ Pb



Vogel et al. (1990); van der Merwe et al (1990)

### Wintering habitat determines arrival time on breeding grounds









Marra et al. (Science 1998)









Gonzalez-Prieto and Hobson, J. Ornith. (2012)

### Breakthrough with water isotopes



## Latest growing-season $\delta^2$ Hp



Wassenaar, IAEA.



## For most birds ...



Altitudinal gradients are recorded in hummingbird feathers:



Hobson et al. Oecologia 136:302-308

## The feather isotopes follow large scale trajectories in precip $\delta D$



Ecuador:  $\delta D_f = -25.6 + E(-0.014) - 25 \circ/00$ 

Global:  $\delta D_f = -22 + E(0.0224) - 25 \circ/00$ 







19月2日7月2月

772020

## "Leapfrog" migration revealed ..







Kelly et al. (Oecologia 2002)

## Other isotopic delineations of population structure ...







Rubenstein et al. (Science 2002)

## Incorporating uncertainty in assignments .....

#### Chapter 12 Using Isoscapes to Model Probability Surfaces for Determining Geographic Origins

Michael B. Wunder

*Ecological Applications*, 18(2), 2008, pp. 549–559 © 2008 by the Ecological Society of America

#### IMPROVED ESTIMATES OF CERTAINTY IN STABLE-ISOTOPE-BASED METHODS FOR TRACKING MIGRATORY ANIMALS

Michael B. Wunder<sup>1,3</sup> and D. Ryan Norris<sup>2</sup>



















- 24 - 20

16

12

8



Hobson et al. JFO (2014)



## Applying prior probabilities

















Raw Isotope Assignment

### **BBS** Abundance



Assignment with Prior



## Combining genetics and $\delta D$







Fig. 10. Breeding subregions of western birds defined by stable hydrogen and genetic contours obtained b overlapping the kriging results of  $\delta D$  values for feathers with west predicted probabilities. The exclusion zon corresponds to the area east of the 10% west genetic contour (dashed black line).



Boulet et al. (Ornithol Monogr)



Ruegg et al. 2014





Gómez-Diaz and González-Solis

## Origins of Woodpigeons killed in France

Several distinct populations with specific migratory traits





Long-range migrant (winter southern range of Europe)

Medium-range migrant (winter in France)

sedentary /









# Modeling isoscapes and origins using multiple isotopes

Assumes a multivariate normal distribution
All isotopes are orthogonal





## Major overwintering site for Palearctic-Aftrotopical migrants



### Plant isotope distribution models

%C<sub>4</sub> x (-12 %) + %C<sub>3</sub> x (-27 %)



Plant  $\delta^{13}C$  (‰)



 Plant isotope map based on predicted C3 vs. C4 plants

Still and Powell (2010)
### Feather $\delta^{13}$ C isoscape



### A feather $\delta^{15}$ N isoscape Based on Craine et al. (2009, New Phytologist)

#### • Modeled MAT, MAP with foliar $\delta^{15}N$





### Feather $\delta^{15}N$ isoscape



### Feather $\delta^2 H$ isoscape



# Combining $\delta^{13}$ C, $\delta^{15}$ N, $\delta^{2}$ H feather isoscapes







# Combining two isotopes into a single probability surface





## A multi-isotope ( $\delta^2$ H, $\delta^{13}$ C, $\delta^{15}$ N) probability surface











# Some other considerations and future directions....





Fig. 1. Map showing the individual GNIP stations that measured the (weighted) annual mean  $\delta^2$ H and  $\delta^{18}$ O composition of precipitation for at least 1 year during 1960–2001 (N=467). Background map shows the annual mean temperature (WorldClim data; see Hijmans et al., 2005).



### Advances in water isoscapes







#### Trace element/heavy isotope

| н  | ]  | Biological and Water Samples |       |      |    |     |    |     |     |    |     |    |     |     |    |       | He |     |    |    |    |
|----|----|------------------------------|-------|------|----|-----|----|-----|-----|----|-----|----|-----|-----|----|-------|----|-----|----|----|----|
| Li | Be |                              | BCNOF |      |    |     |    |     |     |    |     |    |     |     |    |       |    | Ne  |    |    |    |
| Na | Mg |                              |       |      |    |     |    |     |     |    |     |    |     |     |    | Si    | F  |     | S  | CI | Ar |
| к  | Са | Sc                           | Т     | i I  | V  | Cr  | Mi | n F | e C | ò  | Ni  | Cι | ı Z | n G | Эa | Ge    | A  | s S | e  | Br | Kr |
| Rb | Sr | Y                            | Z     | r N  | ۱b | Мo  | Τe | R   | u F | Rh | Pd  | Ag | 3 C | dI  | n  | Sn    | S  | b T | e  | I  | Xe |
| Cs | Ва | La                           | н     | lf 1 | Га | W   | Re | 0   | s   | r  | Pt  | Αι | л Н | g . | TI | Pb    | В  | i P | 0  | At | Rn |
| Fr | Ra | Ac                           | Ac    |      |    |     |    |     |     |    |     |    |     |     |    |       |    |     |    |    |    |
|    |    |                              |       |      |    |     |    |     |     |    |     |    |     |     |    |       |    |     |    |    |    |
|    |    |                              | Се    | Pr   | N  | d F | 'n | Sm  | Eu  | G  | d T | Гb | Dy  | Но  | E  | ir l' | Tm | Yb  | Lu | ı  |    |
|    |    |                              | Th    | Pa   |    | LN  | In | Pa  | Δm  |    | m F | зk | Cf  | F۹  | 1  | n I   | ЫN | No  | 1. |    |    |



#### Compound specific Mass spectrometry